



Tweede Kamer
DER STATEN-GENERAAL

Annual report 2023

Report by the Committee for the Intelligence and
Security Services (CIVD) on its activities in 2023

Adopted on 29 May 2024

Report by the Committee for the Intelligence and Security Services on its activities in 2023

REPORT

Adopted on 29 May 2024.

The Committee for the Intelligence and Security Services has the honour of publishing a report on its activities in 2023.

Chair of the Committee,

Wilders

1. Introduction

The Committee for the Intelligence and Security Services (referred to below as the CIVD or the committee) is charged with parliamentary scrutiny of the classified aspects of government policy regarding the General Intelligence and Security Service (referred to below as the AIVD) and the Military Intelligence and Security Service (referred to below as the MIVD). The committee believes it important to account to the House of Representatives for the way it has carried out the tasks entrusted to it by the House. In this annual report the committee seeks to provide as transparent an overview as possible of its activities in 2023.

The committee's existence and composition is regulated in Section 7.5 of the Rules of Procedure of the House of Representatives. In principle, the government provides information about the AIVD and the MIVD to the House of Representatives publicly, wherever possible. In practice, the information is provided to the permanent committees for the Interior and Kingdom Relations and Defence respectively. In cases where the interests of the state override the need for such information to be made public, the Intelligence and Security Services Act 2017 (referred to below as the ISS Act 2017) allows for the provision of information to the Senate and the House of Representatives to be made on a confidential basis.¹ In the House of Representatives such information is provided to the Committee for the Intelligence and Security Services. As the information and documents provided to the committee by the relevant ministers are classified as state secret, it meets behind closed doors.

The committee notes that in 2023, more than in previous years, the government was unable to fully inform the CIVD for a variety of reasons, despite requests from the committee to do so. In all three cases the ministers explained their considerations regarding the provision of information to the CIVD, in response to questions from the committee in this regard.

This annual report first discusses the composition and support of the committee, as well as the frequency of meetings and the attendance rate in 2023. A brief description of the type of activities and meeting documents is included thereafter. [Provisionally include: A more elaborate description can be found on the House of Representatives' website - insert link]. Finally, this report provides a chronological overview of the content of committee activities in 2023.

2. Committee composition and support in 2023

Pursuant to Section 7.5 of the Rules of Procedure of the House of Representatives, the committee's members before the elections to the House of Representatives on 22 November 2023 were the parliamentary party leaders of the VVD (Sophie Hermans, also committee chairman), D66 (Jan Paternotte), the CDA (Pieter Heerma, later Henri Bontenbal), the PVV (Geert Wilders) and the PvdA (Attje Kuiken). On 27 October 2023 the PvdA and GroenLinks parliamentary parties merged, meaning that Attje Kuiken was no longer the parliamentary party leader. Jesse Klaver, who is leader of the GL-PvdA parliamentary party, was appointed to the CIVD following a proposal by the CIVD. The illustration below shows the committee members until 5 December 2023, which was the date on which the House of Representatives was dissolved.

¹ See primarily Articles 12 and 113 of the ISS Act 2017, and the Explanatory Memorandum (Parliamentary paper 34 588, no. 3, p. 186).

Situation until elections

2023	VVD	D66	CDA	PVV	PvdA	GL-PvdA
Jan	Ms. Hermans	Mr. Paternotte	Mr. Heerma	Mr. Wilders	Ms. Kuiken*	
Feb	MP for 968 days	MP for 720 days	MP for 1,561 days	MP for 6,241 days	MP for 607 days	
Mar						
Apr						
May						
Jun						
Jul						
Aug						
Sept			Mr. Bontenbal			
Oct			MP for 92 days			
Nov						Mr. Klaver*
Dec						MP for 2,156 days

* On 27 October 2023 the PvdA and GroenLinks parliamentary parties merged, meaning that Attje Kuiken was no longer the parliamentary party leader. Jesse Klaver, who is leader of the GL-PvdA parliamentary party, was appointed to the CIVD following a proposal by the CIVD.

The new House of Representatives was installed on 6 December 2023. Thereafter the committee consisted of the parliamentary party leaders of the PVV (Geert Wilders, also committee chair), GroenLinks-PvdA (Frans Timmermans) and New Social Contract (Pieter Omtzigt). As the VVD and D66 parliamentary party leaders were still part of the caretaker government, Sophie Hermans (VVD) and Jan Paternotte (D66) replaced Dilan Yeşilgöz-Zegerius (VVD) and Rob Jetten (D66).² The illustration below shows the committee members as of 6 December 2023.

Situation after the elections

2023	PVV	GL-PvdA	VVD	NSC	D66
Dec	Mr. Wilders	Mr. Timmermans	Ms. Hermans**	Mr. Omtzigt	Mr. Paternotte***
	MP for 6,241 days	MP for 26 days	MP for 968 days	MP for 26 days	MP for 720 days

** In accordance with Section 7.5 paragraph 4 of the Rules of Procedure, Sophie Hermans replaced Dilan Yeşilgöz-Zegerius, given that Ms Yeşilgöz-Zegerius was a minister during this period.

*** In accordance with Section 7.5 paragraph 4 of the Rules of Procedure, Jan Paternotte replaced Rob Jetten, given that Mr Jetten was a minister during this period.

The committee is supported by its own staff who are a clerk (also senior advisor), an advisor, an assistant, a knowledge coordinator, an information specialist and two members of staff from the Parliamentary Reporting Office. No changes were made to the committee support staff in 2023.

3. Meeting frequency and rate of attendance in 2023

The committee held meetings 44 times in 2023 and also carried out three working visits. This is a decrease compared to 2022, when the committee met 55 times. This can be explained by the technical briefings which were regularly held in 2022 due to the outbreak of the conflict between

² See Section 7.5 of the Rules of Procedure of the House of Representatives.

Russia and Ukraine. The average rate of attendance at the committee meetings in 2023 was 83%, which is the same as in 2022.

Various overviews of the CIVD's activities and the rates of attendance are included in graphs in the appendix to this annual report.

4. Type of committee meetings and activities

The committee meets for regular meetings, extra meetings, meetings behind closed doors, technical briefings, discussions and working visits. Reports of committee activities are classified as state secret. A more detailed description of the types of meetings and activities is available on the CIVD website [\[insert hyperlink\]](#).

Regular meetings

Regular meetings are used to discuss documents and policy documents from the Minister of the Interior and Kingdom Relations, the Minister of Defence and the Minister of Justice and Security concerning the AIVD, the MIVD and the National Coordinator for Security and Counterterrorism (referred to below as the NCTV), as well as classified documents from the Review Committee on the Intelligence and Security Services (referred to below as the CTIVD), the Netherlands Court of Audit, and the Review Board for the Use of Powers (referred to below as the TIB), including the relevant responses by the ministers in question. Lastly, the committee is informed verbally and in writing about current issues, and is given presentations on specific topics or countries.

Additional meetings

Additional meetings are planned on an ad hoc basis with the minister or ministers concerned, for example as a result of a specific event.

Meetings attended only by committee members

These are meetings of committee members which are held behind closed doors. Such meetings are generally of a decision-making nature.

Technical briefings

Technical briefings are intended to provide the committee with a clarification of (technical) aspects of a certain theme or dossier. Generally speaking, this concerns themes which the committee wishes to discuss in more detail because it considers more knowledge of the theme in question to be desirable for its scrutinising role.

Discussions

Apart from meetings and technical briefings the committee holds discussions with the CTIVD, the Netherlands Court of Audit, and the TIB. Topics of discussion include the classified appendices to CTIVD review reports, classified reports from the Netherlands Court of Audit, and classified letters from the TIB.

Working visits

The committee aims to pay several working visits to the AIVD, MIVD and the NCTV every year. The committee may also go on a working visit abroad.

5. Type of committee meeting documents

The committee discusses various (policy) papers.

5.1 AIVD/MIVD budget and accountability information

See the appendix for details of the committee's schedule for discussing the budgetary and accountability documents listed below.

Integrated Intelligence and Security Order

The Integrated Intelligence and Security Order describes various parties' need for intelligence. The Integrated Intelligence and Security Order comprises a public section and a classified section. The classified section, which is discussed by the committee, consists of the investigation objectives for the next four years, as well as the division of tasks between the AIVD and the MIVD. The Integrated Intelligence and Security Order is evaluated every year and amended as desired. These evaluations are also discussed by the committee.

Budget letters

On Budget Day the committee receives the (classified) budget letters for the AIVD and MIVD. These letters deal with the classified aspects of the public budgets, focusing on the budget breakdown for the various sections of the AIVD and the MIVD and on the trends that will be of relevance to national security in the forthcoming year.

Annual plans

The Minister of the Interior and Kingdom Relations and the Minister of Defence draw up the annual plans for the AIVD and the MIVD respectively on the basis of the budgets and the Integrated Intelligence and Security Order. The annual plans contain the investigation plans for the coming year and the objectives with respect to organisational developments. The CIVD discusses the classified versions of the annual plans.

Progress reports

The AIVD and the MIVD issue progress reports three times a year, one of which is the classified annual report (see below). In these progress reports, which are classified as state secret, the AIVD and the MIVD account for the progress of their operational activities, as established in the annual plans, for the period concerned.

Annual reports

Every year the AIVD and the MIVD issue a public report on how they performed their tasks in the previous calendar year. The public annual report makes no reference to information that reveals the resources used by the security services in specific cases, the classified resources used by the security services, and the services' current knowledge level. These details do appear in the classified annual reports, which are submitted to the CIVD.

5.2 Other meeting documents

Terrorist Threat Assessment Netherlands (Dreigingsbeeld Terrorisme Nederland)

The committee also discusses the state secret version of the Terrorist Threat Assessment Netherlands (referred to below as DTN) which is drawn up by the NCTV. The DTN is a periodical analysis of radicalisation, extremism and the terrorist threat facing the Netherlands and is based on information from, among other sources, the AIVD and the MIVD.

Cyber Security Assessment Netherlands (Cybersecuritybeeld Nederland)

The committee also discusses the classified version of the Cyber Security Assessment Netherlands (referred to below as CSAN). The CSAN provides an insight into the digital threat, the interests that may be affected as a result, the level of resilience and the risks in relation to cybersecurity.

Letters on current issues

Before every regular meeting the committee receives a letter on current issues the AIVD and the MIVD are facing from the Minister of the Interior and Kingdom Relations and the Minister of Defence. The AIVD and the MIVD use the letters to inform the committee about current events and developments.

Letters from ministers containing supplementary information

The committee can ask the responsible minister(s) to provide additional information on specific topics or investigations. They can also send letters to the committee of their own volition. When the committee receives (classified) letters on subjects other than the intelligence and security services, it first decides in a meeting attended only by committee members whether it indeed wishes to discuss these documents.

Documents from the CTIVD, TIB and the Netherlands Court of Audit

Some documents from the CTIVD, the TIB or the Netherlands Court of Audit are classified as state secret. The committee discusses this type of document at two junctures:

- In a discussion with the document's author: The CTIVD, TIB, or Netherlands Court of Audit then clarifies the document and answers any questions the committee might have. These discussions take place in the presence of the ministers and representatives from the AIVD, the MIVD and the NCTV.
- In a regular meeting: The committee questions the responsible minister(s) about the document. The CTIVD, TIB, or Netherlands Court of Audit are not present at this meeting.

Letters from third parties

Lastly, the committee receives letters from the public and institutions about the AIVD and MIVD. The committee decides on how to deal with these letters in meetings attended only by committee members.

6. Chronological overview of topics and documents, including policy documents, discussed by the committee

January 2023

25 January 2023: Meeting attended only by committee members

At its first meeting behind closed doors in 2023 the committee discussed, among other things, the possible options for a working visit abroad.

26 January 2023: Regular meeting

The committee met for its first regular meeting of 2023. The Minister of Defence and the Minister of Justice and Security did not attend, whereupon the committee called on the government, via the Minister of the Interior and Kingdom Relations to ensure that ministers did attend CIVD meetings. The committee then received a briefing on the conflict between Russia and Ukraine. Among other things the MIVD Director and the DG AIVD addressed developments within the Russian armed forces, a Ukrainian offensive, Russian attacks on utilities and civilian targets, the effects of sanctions and the role of the Wagner Group.

In the MIVD's letter on current issues the MIVD Director informed the committee about a relationship between two countries in the field of counterproliferation. Committee members also asked questions on the threat posed by ISIS, Iran's nuclear weapons capabilities, the threat posed by Chinese students and the consequences of a cyber incident. With regard to the AIVD's letter on current issues the committee asked about an extremist group, a case of possible undesirable knowledge transfer, threat developments in the area of criminal undermining, an acknowledged counterintelligence operation and arrests made in relation to suspected terrorist activity in Stein³.

³ Public Prosecution Service (22-12-2022), *Twee aanhoudingen vanwege verdenking terrorisme* [press release]. Consulted on 12 March 2024, <https://www.om.nl/actueel/nieuws/2022/12/22/twee-aanhoudingen-vanwege-verdenking-terrorisme>.

February 2023

1 February 2023: Extra meeting

The committee had asked to receive an explanatory letter following the arrest of a suspected IS security chief in Arkel (referred to below as the Arkel case).⁴ This letter, which was received on 24 January, was the reason for this extra meeting with the Minister of the Interior and Kingdom Relations and the Minister of Justice and Security. The committee members asked the Minister of Justice and Security questions about the individual's asylum procedure and the role of the AIVD in that context. The committee also asked for attention to focus, in a general sense, on identifying signs of asylum seekers' possible involvement in terrorism during the asylum and post-arrival procedure. In a subsequent letter the committee asked for a clarification regarding which information could be shared publicly and which could not, with the committee insisting on as much information being made public as possible.

2 February 2023: Working visit

During its examination of the Integrated Intelligence and Security Order on 15 December 2022, the committee expressed its desire to schedule a number of in-depth technical briefings on some of the major themes and country studies it contained.⁵ In that context the committee paid a working visit to two joint teams of the AIVD and MIVD on 2 February.

8 February 2023: Meeting attended only by committee members

The committee discussed possible options for a working visit abroad and decided on the schedule of its next domestic working visit.

9 February 2023: Regular meeting

In this regular meeting the committee again discussed the Arkel case with the Minister of the Interior and Kingdom Relations and the Minister of Justice and Security. The committee repeated its request for the follow-up letters and documents on the subject to be split into a state secret part for the CIVD and a public part for public deliberation.

The committee then considered four letters it had requested. Firstly, there was a discussion of a letter from the Ministers of the Interior and Kingdom Relations and Defence on the comparison between the Integrated Intelligence and Security Order 2019-2022 and the Integrated Intelligence and Security Order 2023-2026.⁶ Secondly, a letter from the Minister of the Interior and Kingdom Relations was discussed on how to inform the committee when the AIVD and/or MIVD are investigating specific individuals. The related discussion led to agreements between the government and the committee on how and when to inform. Thirdly, there was a discussion of a letter from the Minister of the Interior and Kingdom Relations following a terrorism case abroad. Lastly, the committee discussed a letter from the Minister of Justice and Security on the government's possible efforts in the context of a terrorist organisation's freedom of movement in a particular country.⁷

In the context of the AIVD's letter on current issues, the committee asked about Russian sanctions, the increased threat from Islamic State Khorasan Province (ISKP) and ISIS and cooperation with another service. The committee asked for a letter to clarify this latter point, as well as further clarification from the AIVD. The letter on current issues from the MIVD was accepted for information purposes. The committee received a brief update during the briefing on the Russia-Ukraine conflict.

⁴ Public Prosecution Service (17-01-2023), *Vermoedelijke veiligheidschef van Islamitische Staat opgepakt in Arkel* [press release]. Consulted on 12 March 2024, <https://www.om.nl/actueel/nieuws/2023/01/17/vermoedelijke-veiligheidschef-van-islamitische-staat-opgepakt-in-arkel>.

⁵ See also the 2022 CIVD Annual Report, p. 20 (Parliamentary Paper 36 340, no. 1).

⁶ See also the 2022 CIVD Annual Report, p. 20 (Parliamentary Paper 36 340, no. 1).

⁷ The committee discussed this topic at various junctures in 2019, 2020, 2021 and 2022. See CIVD Annual Reports for 2019 (Parliamentary Paper 35 309, no. 1), 2020 (Parliamentary Paper 35 810, no. 1), 2021 (Parliamentary Paper 36 134, no. 1) and 2022 (Parliamentary Paper 36 340, no. 1).

March 2023

20 March 2023: Working visit

The committee paid a working visit to the joint AIVD and MIVD team that is investigating China.

29 March 2023: Meeting attended only by committee members

During this closed-door meeting the committee discussed a letter it had received from the Minister of Foreign Affairs. This letter was a response to questions raised by the committee at the end of 2022 regarding the classified annex to the Cammaert committee report on the NLA programme in Syria.⁸ The committee had asked these questions before taking a decision as to whether it should discuss the documents and, if so, how. The committee decided to ask additional questions.

The committee also adopted its annual report for 2022 and decided to accept a letter from a member of the public for information purposes. Lastly, the committee established the theme for its next (domestic) working visit.

30 March 2023: Discussion with the Netherlands Court of Audit

The committee received a verbal explanation of a classified report from the Netherlands Court of Audit, which the committee had recently received.

30 March 2023: Regular meeting

After the government had dealt with a number of commitments, the committee discussed several letters it had requested. These included a letter from the Minister of the Interior and Kingdom Relations and a letter from the Minister of Justice and Security on a terrorism case, and a letter from the Minister of the Interior and Kingdom Relations following the Arkel case.⁹ Another letter from the Minister of the Interior and Kingdom Relations led to a discussion on the considerations when entering into a partnership with foreign services (the so-called assessment memoranda¹⁰). The committee requested the assessment memorandum of the foreign service in question, and a list of services with which cooperation can only take place under strict conditions.

In the context of the letters on current issues from the AIVD, the committee members raised questions about a cyber threat against the travel and aviation sector, China's role in the conflict between Russia and Ukraine, the offensive cyber capabilities of a specific country and possible jihadist threats as a result of a Koran violation. The letters on current issues from the MIVD were adopted for information purposes.

Finally, the MIVD Director and the DG AIVD updated the committee on the conflict between Ukraine and Russia, including the effects of Western arms supplies. After a number of questions had been asked, the Minister of Defence promised to elaborate on Russia's nuclear rhetoric next time.

April 2023

12 April 2023: Meeting attended only by committee members

The committee looked ahead to the regular meeting and discussed a planned working visit abroad. In the light of monthly Ukraine briefings on how the conflict is progressing and its effects on the national security of the Netherlands and Europe, the committee decided to conduct a working visit to Lithuania.

⁸ See also the 2022 CIVD Annual Report, p. 20 (Parliamentary Paper 36 340, no. 1).

⁹ See the details of the meeting of 9 February 2023.

¹⁰ Article 88(2) of the ISS Act 2017 states: 'Prior to entering into a partnership [...], the service will assess, on the basis of the criteria [...] whether it is possible to enter into a partnership and, if so, what the nature and intensity of the intended cooperation may be.' An assessment memorandum describes the outcome of this assessment for a specific foreign service. The criteria according to which the assessment is carried out are described in Article 88(3) of the ISS Act 2017.

13 April 2023: Regular meeting

The committee first discussed the classified report of the Netherlands Court of Audit which it had received at an earlier date.¹¹

The committee also discussed developments relating to the international solution regarding the satellite ground station in Burum with the Minister of Defence.¹² Among other things the committee asked about any vulnerabilities of the chosen solution and enquired about maintaining independence and compliance with the ISS Act 2017.

The committee discussed the AIVD and MIVD's letters on current issues and, lastly, was briefed on three topics, namely the AIVD's and MIVD's intended transparency and the AIVD, MIVD and NCTV's cooperation with private actors on increasing the level of resilience to cyber threats. The third briefing dealt with developments in Ukraine and Russia, focusing on the 'Discord Leaks' in the United States, Russia's nuclear rhetoric,¹³ Ukrainian air defences and a Ukrainian offensive. During the roundtable meeting the DG AIVD spoke about the increased jihadist terrorist threat and its impact on AIVD investigations. During this meeting the committee also expressed its dissatisfaction with the fact that the Minister of Defence could not brief even the CIVD on all aspects of a specific issue.

14 April 2023: Technical briefing

At its request the committee was briefed by the AIVD on anti-institutional extremism.

24 to 26 April 2023: Working visit abroad

The committee went on a working visit to Lithuania from 24 to 26 April.¹⁴ There the committee met its counterpart in the Lithuanian parliament, namely the National Security and Defence Committee. The committee members also visited a military base in Rukla, where Dutch military personnel are contributing to NATO's enhanced Forward Presence (eFP), in order to gain a better insight into this mission in the context of the threat from Russia.

May 2023

10 May 2023: Meeting attended only by committee members

During this meeting the committee reflected on its working visit to Lithuania. It also discussed a letter from the Minister of Foreign Affairs which provided additional answers to questions raised by the committee on the classified annex to the Cammaert committee report.¹⁵ The committee decided to ask questions once again because the answers provided were insufficiently specific to enable the committee to decide on its examination of the annex. The committee asked the minister to indicate whether and, if so which, obstacles existed to sharing the annex received by the CIVD (confidentially) with the Permanent Committee on Foreign Affairs.

11 May 2023: Discussion with the TIB

The committee spoke for the first time to the new TIB chairman, who had started work on 1 April 2023. The committee asked questions about the TIB's 2022 annual report and its classified annex. The committee asked, for example, about overarching trends in the fulfilment of TIB's supervisory task, about various differences which exist between the AIVD and the MIVD, and the reasons for redacting rather than omitting passages in the public version of the annual report.

11 May 2023: Regular meeting

The committee again discussed the Arkel case. More specifically it discussed the system check and learning evaluation received by the committee with regard to recognising signals of possible terrorist

¹¹ See also the discussion with the Netherlands Court of Audit and the regular meeting on 30 March 2023.

¹² At the meeting of 4 April 2019, the committee asked to be kept informed about the developments on the international solution regarding the NSO satellite ground station in Burum. The Minister of Defence promised to do so. See the 2019 CIVD Annual Report, p. 10 (Parliamentary Paper 35 309, no. 1).

¹³ In accordance with the commitment made during the regular meeting of 30 March 2023.

¹⁴ House of Representatives (25-04-2023, *Commissie voor de Inlichtingen- en Veiligheidsdiensten bezoekt Litouwen* [press release]. Consulted on 12 March 2024, <https://www.tweedekamer.nl/nieuws/kamernieuws/commissie-voor-de-inlichtingen-en-veiligheidsdiensten-bezoekt-litouwen>.

¹⁵ See also the details of the meeting attended only by committee members of 29 March 2023.

involvement in the asylum and post-arrival procedure. The public version of the evaluations was discussed by the Permanent Committee on Justice and Security.¹⁶

In the context of the AIVD's letter on current issues the committee raised questions about, for example, a specific cyber threat, a possible case of unwanted financing and the arrest of five ISIS supporters in Sweden. In the context of the MIVD's letter on current issues, the committee asked about a case on quantum technology that could also be used militarily, the conflict in Sudan, North Korea's nuclear capabilities and a hack by a Chinese state cyberactor on a Ministry of Defence computer network.¹⁷ Lastly, the committee was briefed on the conflict between Russia and Ukraine.

22 May 2023: Working visit

The committee paid a working visit to the AIVD and MIVD on the deployment of virtual agents.

31 May 2023: Meeting attended only by committee members

The committee once again reflected on its working visit to Lithuania. It decided to bring some of the committee's findings to the attention of the Minister of Defence.

In addition, the committee talked through the international solution regarding the satellite ground station in Burum. The committee decided to ask the government for a response to some of the committee's views, which it submitted to the government by letter. In this letter the committee also asked ministers to conduct a review by no later than one year after the international solution comes into force, and to share the results.

June 2023

1 June 2023: Discussion with the Netherlands Court of Audit

The committee spoke with the acting president of the Netherlands Court of Audit about the accountability audits into classified spending by the Ministry of the Interior and Kingdom Relations and the Ministry of Defence. The acting president addressed the AIVD and MIVD capacity to act in light of the Temporary Act and investments contained in the coalition agreement. The discussion also focused on underspending by both services, particularly the MIVD. Lastly, there was an exchange of views on the time at which the AIVD and MIVD annual reports would be submitted to the Netherlands Court of Audit.

1 June 2023: Regular meeting

When discussing the (classified) annual reports of the AIVD and MIVD, the committee asked the government to submit the annual reports to the Court of Audit more promptly in future so that the Court of Audit has all the necessary data when it performs its accountability audit. The government pledged to do so and said that it would inform the committee when further arrangements had been made on this. Among other things, the committee asked about increasing staffing levels, the underutilisation at the MIVD, the turnaround times at the Security Screening Unit (partly in light of the recruitment of new staff) and the difference in the size of the AIVD and MIVD budgets. On the latter point the Ministers of the Interior and Kingdom Relations and Defence promised to provide a more detailed, written explanation of this difference. Lastly, the committee indicated that, in order to carry out its scrutinising role, it ought to have a better insight into the reasons for not achieving the Integrated Intelligence and Security Order objectives.

Further to the TIB's annual report the committee asked, among other things, about the services' position with regard to revenues from cable interception operations. Finally the committee discussed a letter from the Minister of the Interior and Kingdom Relations on intelligence in the context of a threat. A discussion of the letters on current issues was postponed due to time constraints.

¹⁶ See Parliamentary Paper 29 754, no 680.

¹⁷ Ministry of Defence (06-02-2024), *MIVD onthult werkwijze Chinese spionage in Nederland* [press release]. Consulted on 12 March 2024, <https://www.defensie.nl/actueel/nieuws/2024/02/06/mivd-onthult-werkwijze-chinese-spionage-in-nederland>.

7 June 2023: Technical briefing

During this technical briefing the committee was updated on developments in the Ukraine-Russia conflict. Among other things the committee discussed Ukraine's offensive and the breaching of the Kakhovka dam.

7 June 2023: Meeting attended only by committee members

The committee decided to schedule an extra meeting, following an article published in the Washington Post on Ukraine's possible role in the sabotage of Nord Stream 1 and 2.¹⁸

14 June 2023: Extra meeting

During this extra meeting the committee spoke with the Minister of Defence, the DG AIVD and the MIVD Director about the sabotaging of Nord Stream 1 and 2, as a result of the article published in the Washington Post. At its request the committee had received a letter from the Minister of Defence.

This meeting was also used to deal with some commitments relating to Russia, Ukraine, Iran and North Korea. A discussion also ensued on how and when to inform the CIVD, following an explanation by the Minister of Defence as to why certain information had not previously been shared with the committee.

26 June 2023: Extra meeting

Following the Wagner Group uprising on 23 and 24 June 2023 the committee convened an extra meeting with the Minister of the Interior and Kingdom Relations, the Minister of Defence, the DG AIVD and the MIVD Director. The committee had also received a letter about these developments.

28 June 2023: Meeting attended only by committee members

The committee discussed the Minister of Foreign Affairs' response to questions raised by the committee on the Cammaert committee report.¹⁹ In this letter the minister undertook to share the classified annex to the report and the answers to the questions raised by the CIVD with the Permanent Committee on Foreign Affairs. The committee therefore decided not to discuss the annex to the report.

The committee also decided on its schedule for working visits, including the relevant topics, and also discussed ways to avoid a situation in which not all agenda items can be dealt with in a meeting due to time constraints. Lastly, the committee decided to schedule an additional (regular) meeting during the summer recess.

29 June 2023: Discussion with the CTIVD

Following the CTIVD's 2022 annual report, the committee spoke to the CTIVD about a number of ongoing investigations. The committee also discussed how the CTIVD is going to perform its supervisory task with regard to the international solution for the disruption to satellite interception in Burum.

29 June 2023: Regular meeting

Immediately prior to this meeting the committee received a letter from the Minister of the Interior and Kingdom Relations on the Iran case, which the committee has repeatedly discussed in recent years.²⁰ The committee decided not to deal with this letter immediately, but instead to ask the minister firstly to provide written answers to some of the committee's questions on the letter.

During the briefing on Ukraine and Russia the MIVD Director addressed, among other things, the threat around the Zaporizja nuclear power plant. The committee asked the Minister of Justice and

¹⁸ Washington Post (06-06-2023), *U.S. had intelligence of detailed Ukrainian plan to attack Nord Stream pipeline*. Consulted on 12 March 2024, <https://www.washingtonpost.com/national-security/2023/06/06/nord-stream-pipeline-explosion-ukraine-russia/>.

¹⁹ See the meetings attended only by committee members of 29 March and 10 May 2023.

²⁰ This case concerns the murder, in 2017, of Iranian-Dutch political activist Ahmad Nissi (referred to as the 'Iran case' in pre-2022 annual reports and as the 'Nissi case' in the 2022 annual report) and it was discussed on various occasions in 2018, 2021 and 2022. See the CIVD Annual Reports for 2018 (Parliamentary Paper 35 185, no. 1), 2021 (Parliamentary Paper 36 134, no. 1) and 2022 (Parliamentary Paper 36 340, no. 1).

Security to submit a letter on the possible impact on the Netherlands of a possible disaster at the Zaporizja nuclear power plant. The DG AIVD and MIVD Director also provided an update on the situation with regard to Wagner, following the uprising of 23 and 24 June 2023.

The 2023 AIVD and MIVD progress reports, which had been placed on the agenda, were the first accountability documents in the new reporting system and style, as the committee had agreed with the services in late 2022.²¹ The committee noted that the papers were easier to read and expressed its appreciation for this. In the context of the AIVD's progress report, the committee focused on the fulfilment of Integrated Intelligence and Security Order objectives in terms of various cyber investigations. The committee also said that it felt that certain information was missing in the progress report. The committee decided to return to this issue at a later date, after it had discussed it behind closed doors. With regard to the MIVD progress report the committee expressed concerns about the service's staffing levels and the consequences of staff shortages on a number of security-enhancing tasks and specific investigative themes.

The committee then discussed the letter from the Ministers of the Interior and Kingdom Relations and Defence which concerned foreign services with which cooperation takes place on the basis of strict conditions, and the assessment memorandum of one specific service.²² The committee raised questions about the textual content of the assessment memorandum and asked whether previous CTIVD recommendations regarding assessment memorandums had been followed up. The committee also enquired about the frequency with which assessment memoranda are updated and why cooperation with some specific services is performed under strict conditions.

The committee also discussed the DTN 58 at this meeting. Among other things the committee enquired about the increased jihadist threat from ISIS and ISKP, the considerations behind the threat level setting and the eight arrests in Belgium of people who were preparing a terrorist attack. The committee also stated that it was under the impression that some public passages in the DTN presented a less worrisome picture than the passages of the DTN which had been classified as state secret. The NCTV explained that the (public) threat assessment should be read as a whole and, on this basis, it was not possible to talk of a reduced threat.

Lastly, the committee discussed the Minister of Justice and Security's replies to written questions on a case which had been submitted by two members of parliament. The Minister of Justice and Security was unable to brief the CIVD in full, for reasons of state interest. The committee expressed its displeasure with this situation and the Minister of Justice and Security replied that, although careful consideration had been given to this issue, she would check with the relevant agencies before the next meeting to determine whether she could brief the CIVD on a specific item.

August 2023

7 August 2023: Working visit

The committee paid a working visit to the MIVD to be updated on current developments in Ukraine.

30 August 2023: Meeting attended only by committee members

Looking ahead to the November 2023 House of Representatives elections, the committee took some decisions on upcoming committee activities. One of these decisions was to postpone working visits until after the elections. The committee also discussed its observation that certain information was missing in the progress report.²³ The committee decided to ask the government to inform the CIVD on this issue in future as well.

The committee also discussed two items which were on the agenda of the regular meeting of 31 August 2023. The first concerned the difference in the size of the AIVD and MIVD budgets. As

²¹ At the end of 2022 the committee had discussed its information needs with the services in respect of the services' budget and accountability documents, in order to ensure that it could perform its scrutinising role as optimally as possible. See the 2022 CIVD Annual Report, p. 17 and 18 (Parliamentary Paper 36 340, no. 1).

²² See the regular meeting of 30 March 2023.

²³ See the regular meeting of 29 June 2023.

promised during the regular meeting on 1 June 2023, the committee received a letter explaining the discrepancy in more detail. The committee felt that the contents of this letter still did not give the committee sufficient insight into the reasons for the difference in budgets, partly because it did not include a quantified comparison. The committee decided to communicate its need for information on this issue to the Netherlands Court of Audit and to ask them to consider including it in accountability audits.

The second item concerned the case of Iran. As requested during the regular meeting of 29 June 2023, the committee had received a supplementary letter from the Minister of the Interior and Kingdom Relations. Further to this letter the committee decided to ask the CTIVD to investigate certain aspects of the Iran case in relation to the AIVD.

31 August 2023: Regular meeting

During this meeting the committee first focused on the conflict between Russia and Ukraine. The committee spoke to the Minister of Defence and the Minister of the Interior and Kingdom Relations about the crash involving the plane on which Wagner leader Prigozhin was travelling. The committee also discussed a letter from the Minister of Justice and Security on the possible consequences of an incident at the Zaporizja nuclear power plant, which the committee had requested during its regular meeting on 29 June 2023.

These meetings were also an opportunity to deal with a number of commitments. For example, the DG AIVD gave a short briefing on a country, in response to which the committee asked that it be sent a baseline assessment of the country in question at a later date. Furthermore, the Minister of Justice and Security returned to the question posed in the regular meeting of 29 June 2023 regarding whether she could provide the committee, after all, with further information on a specific subject. It had previously been impossible to disclose said information in full to the CIVD for reasons of state interest. The minister stated that the conclusion was that the minister was unable to inform the CIVD. She clarified her considerations and stated that all the options had been extensively assessed. The committee asked additional questions on this matter, but was forced to resign itself to the minister's decision.

During the discussion of the CSAN 2023 the committee noted that – to its satisfaction – it had already been informed about all the passages in the document which had been classified as state secret, mainly in letters on current issues from the AIVD and MIVD. The committee therefore accepted the document for information purposes.

The committee then spoke about the disruption of an ISKP network that intended to carry out an attack.²⁴ Following two letters on the subject, the committee raised questions about the provision of information to the CIVD on this case. It called on the government to be clearer and more precise in its references to previous information provided to the CIVD in the future, so that it is clear to the committee that there is a link between the information provided. The minister indicated that this had inadvertently not been done in this case and promised that more attention would be paid to this in the future.

The committee also discussed two letters from the Minister of the Interior and Kingdom Relations on the Iran case and announced that it would ask the CTIVD to conduct an independent investigation into certain aspects of the Iran case in relation to the AIVD.

Lastly, the committee discussed a number of letters on current issues from the AIVD and MIVD. With regard to the letter on the AIVD the committee raised questions about past cases of possible unwanted foreign funding and the new leader of ISIS. It also discussed terrorism detainees. With

²⁴ Public Prosecution Service (06-07-2023), *Man uit Tadzjikistan en vrouw uit Kirgizië aangehouden op verdenking terrorisme* [persbericht]. Consulted on 12 March 2024, <https://www.om.nl/actueel/nieuws/2023/07/06/man-uit-tadzjikistan-en-vrouw-uit-kirgizie-aangehouden-op-verdenking-terrorisme>.

regard to the MIVD the committee enquired about Wagner's activities in Africa and a case of possible sanction evasion. The committee also asked about the coup in Gabon.

October 2023

4 October 2023: Meeting attended only by committee members

Among other things the committee discussed the composition of the committee, given that MP Attje Kuiken informed the meeting that the PvdA and GroenLinks parliamentary parties were likely to merge in the near future.

5 October 2023: Regular meeting

This regular meeting started with a briefing on Ukraine and Russia. During this briefing the discussion focused on, for example, the likelihood of peace negotiations, developments within Wagner and unwanted Russian interference. The committee also enquired about the possible cooperation between Russia and China on drones, following media reports on this matter.²⁵ A large number of commitments were then dealt with, for example with regard to the new leader of ISIS and a case of possible sanction evasion.

The committee also discussed the AIVD and MIVD budget letters. The committee paid particular attention to understaffing in both services and asked about the services' commitment to addressing these shortfalls. It also asked about any effects of staff shortages on the realisation of Integrated Intelligence and Security Order objectives. Some specific questions were also asked, for example on the allocation of joint costs.

A number of letters were then discussed, namely a letter on intelligence in the context of a threat, a letter on past cases of possible unwanted foreign funding, a letter which was sent as a result of the classified report of the Netherlands Court of Audit²⁶ and a letter on the state of the international solution. Letters on current issues from the AIVD and MIVD were postponed until the next regular meeting due to lack of time.

10 October 2023: Extra meeting

The committee decided to call an extra meeting following Hamas' attack on 7 October 2023. The committee was updated by the ministers, the DG AIVD, the MIVD Director and the NCTV on the latest situation, for instance on the role of various countries in the region and the (potential) implications for the Netherlands. The committee also enquired about the impact of the conflict on the Integrated Intelligence and Security Order, which was still being updated at the time.

11 October 2023: Meeting attended only by committee members

The committee discussed the Minister of Defence's response to the questions raised following its working visit to Lithuania.²⁷ It then spoke about its need for information with regard to budget and accountability documents and its composition, as a consequence of the upcoming merger of the PvdA and Groenlinks parliamentary parties.²⁸

12 October 2023: Regular meeting

After a number of commitments had been dealt with, the committee was briefed on the latest situation in Israel and the Palestinian Territories. The committee asked questions about the intelligence position of the AIVD and MIVD, the implications for the Integrated Intelligence and Security Order, the implications in terms of jihadist threats against the West and future scenarios. The committee then discussed a letter from the Minister of the Interior and Kingdom Relations on the role of the AIVD in consular cases.

This was followed by a discussion of the letters on current issues for this meeting and the previous regular meeting. With regard to the AIVD, questions were raised about unwanted interference in the

²⁵ New York Times (02-10-2023), *Ukraine's War of Drones Runs Into an Obstacle: China*. Consulted on 12 April 2024, <https://www.nytimes.com/2023/09/30/technology/ukraine-russia-war-drones-china.html>.

²⁶ See the meeting of 1 June 2023.

²⁷ See the meeting of 31 May 2023.

²⁸ See the meeting of 4 October 2023.

Netherlands and unwanted interference in elections. Following the letters on current issues from the MIVD, the committee asked about (dual-use) applications of biotechnology and synthetic technology, military threats from China against Taiwan, unmanned surface vessels, Chinese espionage threats against the semiconductor industry and the situation in the Sahel. Lastly and following media reports, the committee discussed the alleged sabotage of a gas pipeline and telecoms cable between Finland and Estonia.²⁹

24 October 2023: Meeting attended only by committee members

The committee discussed its composition, due to the upcoming merger of the PvdA and GroenLinks parliamentary parties.³⁰

25 October 2023: Meeting attended only by committee members

The committee met again to discuss its composition.³¹ The committee decided to nominate Mr Klaver as a member of the CIVD.

30 October 2023: Meeting attended only by committee members

During this meeting the committee discussed the agenda of the extra meeting that same day. The committee also decided that it would no longer include the briefings relating to Ukraine/Russia and Israel/Palestinian Territories as a separate agenda item. The committee decided to ask the ministers to report any relevant developments in the letters on current issues, or to communicate them verbally when discussing those letters.

30 October 2023: Extra meeting

A few days before this extra meeting the Minister of the Interior and Kingdom Relations informed the CIVD in writing about the arrest of two individuals on suspicion of possessing and disclosing state classified information. The people in question were an employee and a former employee of the NCTV, who both also worked for the police.³² At the committee's request it was also sent a letter by the Minister of Justice and Security prior to this meeting containing a response to the arrests. Due to the seriousness and magnitude of the case the committee decided to convene this extra meeting with the Minister of the Interior and Kingdom Relations and the Minister of Justice and Security, despite parliament being in recess due to the elections.

The committee asked critical questions about the case (referred to below as: the (former) NCTV staff case), including about the arrested suspects, the role of the AIVD, the information which was classified as state secret which was found in the suspects' possession, the implications for international cooperation and the impact on national security. The committee also asked questions about information security measures and policies and screening at the NCTV. In addition, the committee asked attention to be paid to the provision of public information to the House of Representatives on the matter.

November 2023

2 November 2023: Meeting attended only by committee members

The committee discussed the letter it had received that morning from the Minister of the Interior and Kingdom Relations on the case of (former) NCTV employees. The committee decided not to discuss this letter in the regular meeting which was going to take place immediately afterwards because it had not had time to prepare properly. The committee therefore decided to schedule an extra meeting in the near future.

²⁹ See, for example: NOS (10-10-2023), *Gas- en telecomverbinding tussen Finland en Estland beschadigd, mogelijk sabotage*. Consulted on 12 April 2024, <https://nos.nl/artikel/2493598-gas-en-telecomverbinding-tussen-finland-en-estland-beschadigd-mogelijk-sabotage>.

³⁰ See the meetings of 4 and 11 October 2023.

³¹ See the meetings of 4, 11 and 12 October 2023.

³² Public Prosecution Service (01-11-2023), *Medewerkers NCTV en politie aangehouden* [press release]. Consulted on 12 March 2024, <https://www.om.nl/actueel/nieuws/2023/11/01/medewerkers-nctv-en-politie-aangehouden>.

2 November 2023: Regular meeting

The committee decided to go ahead with this regular meeting despite parliament being in recess due to the elections. The committee again spoke at length with ministers on the case of (former) NCTV staff. Particular attention was paid to current developments in the case and media coverage following the Public Prosecution Service's press release. The CTIVD's investigation into the AIVD's actions in this case was also discussed. The CTIVD had informed the committee a day earlier that it was going to start this investigation.³³ The committee raised many questions about how the NCTV ought to be independently investigated. The Minister of Justice and Security promised that the investigation would be independent.

The committee then discussed a letter from the Ministers of the Interior and Kingdom Relations and Defence on the timeframe which applies to the submission of annual reports of the AIVD and MIVD to the Netherlands Court of Audit.³⁴ The committee asked for the process to be accelerated and the government promised to take another look at the agreements made. The committee also discussed a letter it had requested on the Brussels attack of 16 October 2023. Among other things the committee enquired about the current threat of an attack on Europe and the Netherlands.

6 November 2023: Meeting attended only by committee members

This meeting was convened because of the documents the committee had received on the case of (former) NCTV employees, which documents were to be discussed with ministers in the extra meeting which was scheduled to take place immediately afterwards.

6 November 2023: extra meeting

At this extra meeting the letters on current issues for the meeting of 2 November 2023 were discussed first of all, as they had not been dealt with at the time due to a lack of time. The issues the committee enquired about included the geopolitical implications of events in the Middle East, instances of unwanted interference by Russia and China, developments in terms of nuclear proliferation, scenarios for the conflict in Ukraine, jihadism in the Sahel and Iran's role in the 7 October 2023 attack.

This meeting was also devoted to the case of (former) NCTV employees and the letters the committee had received on this subject since 30 October, including one on the day of the meeting itself. The committee focused in particular on the letter on the case from the Minister of the Interior and Kingdom Relations and on the question of how this incident could have happened. The committee also spoke further with the Minister of Justice and Security about how the role of the NCTV ought to be investigated.

29 November 2023: Meeting attended only by committee members

The committee decided to convene a meeting with the CTIVD before the Christmas recess to discuss the investigation announced by the CTIVD into the case of (former) NCTV employees and the status of the investigation requested by the CIVD into certain aspects concerning the Iran case in relation to the AIVD.

29 November 2023: Regular meeting

In the process of dealing with a number of commitments the committee was informed about, among other things, how the government had followed up on an AIVD intelligence report on a particular country. The Minister of the Interior and Kingdom Relations also returned to the subject of the agreements made with regard to the timeframe for submitting AIVD and MIVD annual reports to the Netherlands Court of Audit.³⁵ The committee decided to discuss this in more detail with the Netherlands Court of Audit at a later date. Finally, the committee enquired about the nuclear power relationship between China and India.

³³ CTIVD (22-01-2024), *CTIVD onderzoekt rol AIVD in relatie tot verdenking lekken staatsgeheimen door NCTV-medewerkers* [press release]. Consulted on 12 March 2024, <https://www.ctivd.nl/actueel/nieuws/2024/01/22/index>.

³⁴ See the meeting of 1 June 2023.

³⁵ See the regular meeting of 2 November 2023.

The committee decided to discuss the updated Integrated Intelligence and Security Order and the second progress reports of the AIVD and MIVD all in one go. During the discussion of the second progress report, the committee talked at length with the government about the AIVD's remit in the field of criminal undermining. The discussion focused in particular on the role and added value of the AIVD vis-à-vis the police and judiciary, as investigations into organised crime are normally the sole preserve of the police and judiciary. The displacement effects were also discussed, given that any commitment by the AIVD to this issue would inevitably have a detrimental effect on capacity for other investigations. One of the outcomes of the discussion was that the committee would schedule a technical briefing on criminal undermining in 2024. Other topics covered in these documents were the effects of the Gaza conflict on the investigation objectives in the Integrated Intelligence and Security Order, staffing levels at the MIVD, the level of insight into developments in the Sahel, the effects of the destruction of bulk datasets as a consequence of legal provisions, the realisation of the objectives of the Security Investigations Unit³⁶ and the realisation of investigation objectives in the context of investigations into China and certain cyber investigations.

The committee then discussed a letter from the Minister of the Interior and Kingdom Relations on an identified assessment plot. Due to a lack of time a decision was taken to discuss the letters on current issues for this meeting during the next regular meeting. Because the committee had indicated that it had numerous questions about the situation in Ukraine, a decision was taken to schedule a technical briefing on the subject on 21 December 2023.

December 2023

14 December 2023: Regular meeting

The committee met for the first time in its new composition and discussed the baseline assessment of a particular country, which had been requested at an earlier date.³⁷ The committee noted that the baseline assessment had not answered the questions about the AIVD's intelligence position in this country. It also discussed the AIVD's efforts to improve this intelligence position.

In the context of the AIVD's letters on current issues the committee raised questions about espionage by China, AIVD observations in the field of criminal undermining, anti-institutional extremism and a hack by a foreign power in the Netherlands. In response to a report in the letter on current issues on Venezuela, the government pledged to offer a baseline assessment on Venezuela next time. In the context of the letters on current issues from the MIVD, the committee enquired about attacks on military bases in Iraq and developments in uranium enrichment by a particular country.

21 December 2023: Meeting attended only by committee members

The main focus of this meeting was on the adoption of the CIVD's annual schedule for 2024. In 2024 the committee decided to schedule a technical briefing every two months on the situation in Ukraine and Russia, and any other topics that lend themselves to a briefing, in addition to regular meetings and any ad hoc briefings. The committee also discussed the themes for its working visits.

21 December 2023: Technical briefing

During this briefing on the Ukraine-Russia conflict the committee was updated on the battlefield situation, Ukrainian air defence capabilities, Russia-Iran cooperation and Russia's activities in Europe and the Netherlands. Lastly, the DG AIVD took the opportunity to brief the committee on an investigation into a threat of an attack.

21 December 2023: Discussion with the CTIVD

The committee spoke with the chairman of the CTIVD about the scheduling of two ongoing investigations, namely an investigation into certain aspects concerning the Iran case in relation to the AIVD and the investigation into the (former) NCTV staff case. With regard to the latter investigation the committee discussed the relationship of the CTIVD's investigation into the AIVD to

³⁶ See also Parliamentary Paper 29 924, no 256.

³⁷ See the regular meeting of 31 August 2023.

the investigation by the Central Government Audit Service (*Auditdienst Rijk*) into the events of this case and procedures and information security at the NCTV (and the police).³⁸

³⁸ Parliamentary paper 36 410 VI, no 16.



Consideration of AIVD/MIVD budget and (financial) accountability

House of Representatives (public)



January

February-April

May

June

July-August

September

October

November

December

Consideration of evaluation of Integrated Intelligence and Security Order

Start of budget year

Consideration of classified annual reports by the AIVD/MIVD

Consideration of first progress reports by the AIVD/MIVD

Consideration of second progress reports and (classified) budget letters by the AIVD/MIVD

Consideration of classified annual plans of the AIVD/MIVD

Committee for the Intelligence and Security Services (classified)

CIVD activities and attendance rate in 2023

